

TEACHER'S GUIDE FOR

Discovering the world
through **DEBATE**
third edition

Nancy E. Claxton, Ed.D.

INTERNATIONAL DEBATE EDUCATION ASSOCIATION

NEW YORK ● AMSTERDAM ● BRUSSELS

Contents

INTRODUCTION	viii
Preparation	viii
Content of the Textbook	ix
The Course	x
Course Requirements	x
Terminal Course Objectives (TCOs)	x
WEEKLY TOPIC OUTLINE	xiii
WEEK 1	1
OBJECTIVES	1
CHAPTER FOCUS	1
LESSON	1
Warm-up	1
Karl Popper Debate and the Public Sphere (TCO A)	2
The Debate Club in the School Community (TCO Y)	5
Wrap-up	6
ADDITIONAL ACTIVITIES	7
WEEK 2	8
OBJECTIVES	8
CHAPTER FOCUS	8
LESSON	8
Warm-up	8
The Structure of Argument (TCOs B & C)	8
Claims and Propositions (TCO D)	10
Wrap-up	14
WEEK 3	15
OBJECTIVES	15
CHAPTER FOCUS	15
LESSON	15
Warm-up	15
Types of Evidence (TCOs E and F)	15
Warrants (TCOs G & H)	18
Wrap-up	26
WEEK 4	27
OBJECTIVES	27
CHAPTER FOCUS	27
LESSON	27
Warm-up	27
The Quality of Arguments (TCOs I and J)	27
Fallacies	29
Developing Research Skills (TCO R)	31
Wrap-up	33
ADDITIONAL ACTIVITIES	34
WEEK 5	35
OBJECTIVES	35
CHAPTER FOCUS	35

LESSON	35
Warm-up	35
The Karl Popper Debate Format (TCO K & U)	36
Wrap-up	38
ADDITIONAL ACTIVITIES	38
WEEK 6	39
OBJECTIVES	39
CHAPTER FOCUS	39
LESSON	39
Warm-up	39
Constructing Arguments about Claims of Cause and Effect (TCOs M & L)	39
Wrap-up	42
WEEK 7	43
OBJECTIVES	43
CHAPTER FOCUS	43
LESSON	43
Warm-up	43
Constructive Arguments about Claims of Value (TCOs L, N, & O)	43
Wrap-up	46
WEEK 8	47
OBJECTIVES	47
CHAPTER FOCUS	47
LESSON	47
Warm-up	47
Arguing about Simple Policy Propositions (TCOs L & P)	47
Constructing Arguments to Support a Claim of Comparative Policy	50
Wrap-up	52
WEEK 9	53
OBJECTIVES	53
CHAPTER FOCUS	53
LESSON	53
Warm-up	53
Refutation and Rebuttals (TCO Q)	54
Cross-examination (TCOs S & T)	56
Wrap-up	58
ADDITIONAL ACTIVITIES	58
WEEK 10	59
OBJECTIVES	59
CHAPTER FOCUS	59
LESSON	59
Warm-up	59
Arrangement, Style, and Delivery (TCO U & V)	59
Debating in an International Setting (TCO X)	62
Wrap-up	63
ADDITIONAL ACTIVITIES	63
WEEK 11	64
OBJECTIVES	64
CHAPTER FOCUS	64

PREPARATION	64
LESSON	64
Warm-up	64
Judging Debates (TCO W)	64
Wrap-up	67
ADDITIONAL ACTIVITIES	67
WEEK 12	68
OBJECTIVES	68
LESSON	68
Warm-up	68
Final Class Session	68
Wrap-up	70
APPENDIX	
COURSE SYLLABUS	71
WORKSHEETS	
1. DISTINGUISHING BETWEEN CLAIMS, PROPOSITIONS, AND EVIDENCE	74
2. KARL POPPER QUOTES	76
3. GROUP DISCUSSION QUESTIONS FOR KARL POPPER DEBATE TRANSCRIPT AND COMMENTARY READING	78
4. ARGUING AND REFUTING CAUSAL RELATIONSHIPS	82
5. BUILDING A CASE FOR AND AGAINST A SIMPLE VALUE PROPOSITION	83
6. BUILDING A CASE FOR A COMPARATIVEVALUE PROPOSITION - FACT SHEET	86
7. ARGUMENT FLOW SHEET	90
8. KARL POPPER DEBATE BALLOT AND SCORING RUBRIC	91

Introduction

This *Teacher's Guide* serves as a manual for using *Discovering the World through Debate*, third edition. It provides lesson plans for a 12-week course, with 180 minutes of classroom instruction weekly. Activities vary, but all are designed to help students understand debate on a theoretical and practical level.

PREPARATION

Please read the introduction and review the Weekly Topic Outline (p. xiii) to get an overview of how the course is organized and what is expected from the students. Consult the Weekly Topic Outline as you plan your lessons, and remember to read the appropriate sections of the textbook because this guide follows the textbook closely. The guide explains techniques and concepts from the textbook and highlights the key points of each chapter, but it does not replicate the comprehensive information in the textbook.

The *Teacher's Guide* promotes effective teaching through the use of myriad instructional techniques that support effective teaching. Most important, it provides a framework that encourages and nurtures your individual and professional creativity, experience, and insights. While this manual offers a fairly rigid teaching syllabus, we encourage you to structure and configure the content in a way consistent with your professional experience and the needs of your students. Remember to utilize real world examples and applications in your presentations and to provide meaningful feedback to your students based on your own experience with debate. Debate is dynamic and exciting, and thus you should feel free to modify the lesson plans provided or to develop your own.

The *Teacher's Guide* presents material in a variety of instructional approaches and always strives to foster best teaching practices. As you use this manual, follow these general practices:

1. Post the learning objectives for each training session in an accessible place. Posting objectives and referring to them throughout the lesson shows the students that the lesson is structured and carefully thought out. Knowing what the lesson will accomplish makes the students more comfortable in embarking on new approaches and unfamiliar material.
2. Regularly review the Terminal Core Objectives (TCOs) of the course with your students. This review assures them that each session is furthering the goal of the course. Each lesson plan lists the TCOs associated with that session.

3. Regularly assess the progress of your students. Assessment is the key to measuring the students' understanding of the new material. In this course, assessment is based on in-class participation in projects, activities, and debates. There are no out-of-class work expectations, such as papers or exams, because this is a practical course.
4. Start each session with a Warm-up or review of the prior session's objectives and activities. Then introduce the objectives for the current week and briefly explain how these objectives will be met.
5. End each session with a 3 to 5 minute Wrap-up, during which you review the objectives for that lesson and summarize how those objectives were met. You should also answer any remaining questions at this time.

However you choose to use this guide, we hope that it will help you utilize *Discovering the World through Debate* to bring debate alive. Get ready, get set, debate!

CONTENT OF THE TEXTBOOK

The *Discovering the World through Debate*, third edition, is divided into three parts. Part I introduces argumentation theory, focusing on those concepts of argumentation most useful to debaters. Part II discusses constructing arguments in ways appropriate for Karl Popper debate. It begins with a chapter explaining the Karl Popper format and then presents chapters on supporting and opposing propositions of cause and effect, value, and policy. Finally, Part III discusses a variety of debating skills—research, cross-examination, style, and delivery—and concludes with chapters on judging and international debating.

Although they overlap, the three parts of this book are also independent. You can use them in the order presented or in some other order, as you see fit. For instance, you may want to begin with Part II, teaching students the details of the Karl Popper debate format and the methods of constructing cases for and against a proposition. You might then move to Part III to refine students' skills in various aspects of debate and end with Part I and a consideration of how the theory of argumentation informs argument construction and debating skills.

This edition of *Discovering the World through Debate* is a substantial revision of the first two editions. The first two editions of this textbook served the International Debate Education Association (IDEA) community well during the first decade of its development. In recent years, IDEA has introduced more complex kinds of resolutions so that students can learn more advanced forms of debate. This edition is designed to meet the needs of participants who are ready to progress to new and more complex levels of argumentation and debate. All of Part I is entirely new and all but one chapter in Part II is new; the chapters in Part III are substantial revisions of materials presented in the first and second editions.

Note: The examples used in this guide do not represent the views held by the Open Society Institute or the authors of the text.

THE COURSE

The *Teacher's Guide* is keyed to *Discovering the World through Debate*, third edition, which is required reading for the course. The textbook is an introduction to argumentation and to the practical skills needed for debate, specifically using the Karl Popper format. The three broad topics covered are argumentation theory, argument construction, and debating skills.

COURSE REQUIREMENTS

We have organized the course around six basic requirements:

1. **Assigned Readings**—Each lesson will include assigned readings from *Discovering the World through Debate*, third edition. Students should complete the readings before the session so that they can gain the maximum benefit from the lesson.
2. **Debate Analysis**—Students will analyze at least two Karl Popper debates using an argument flow sheet.
3. **Debate Design and Delivery**—Students will design and deliver a structured debate and will also assume the various roles that debaters take on in actual debates.
4. **In-Class Projects**—In-class projects and impromptu debate sessions will help students learn how debates are structured and how to participate in debates. They will also help students understand the demands and expectations of debate judges.
5. **Class Participation**—Because this is a practical course, participants are expected to actively participate in debates and in-class discussions and activities.
6. **Assessment**—Students will be assessed on participation and in debate performance as individuals and as part of a team. Students are expected to attend class regularly.

TERMINAL COURSE OBJECTIVES (TCOs)

Terminal Course Objectives (TCOs) are the main learning objectives that the students taking the course should meet. The following objectives explain what they should know or be able to do by the end of the course:

- A. Given the important elements of argument, define and properly utilize claims, evidence, warrants, and reservations.

- B. Given a model to simulate a theoretical argument, appropriately chart out an argument to ensure all necessary parts are included.
- C. Given evidence and a claim, assess the structure of an argument as simple, convergent, or independent.
- D. Given a claim or proposition, evaluate whether it is a claim of definition, description, relationship, or evaluation.
- E. Given evidence for a claim, categorize it as reality-based or preference-based or a combination of reality- and preference-based.
- F. Given a value hierarchy, categorize whether the evidence is organized according to quantity, quality, order, existent, essence, or person.
- G. Given an argumentative warrant, categorize it as example, analogy, causal warrant, authority, principle, incompatibility, or disassociation, or some combination of these warrants, by its use in an argument.
- H. Given a criterion for logical assessment of an argument, assess if the standards of acceptability, relevance, and sufficiency are met.
- I. Given a fallacy, identify how it fails to meet a criterion for logical assessment of an argument.
- J. Given an example of a Karl Popper debate, devise or analyze a debate within the established format.
- K. Given the claim of an argument, classify it as a cause-and-effect, value, or policy claim.
- L. Given an argument to defend or attack, apply the five steps of refutation to a debate.
- M. Given a debate topic, develop a plan to generate general and specific knowledge.
- N. Given an opportunity to cross-examine the other team, question the opponent appropriately, flexibly, pointedly, specifically, and with innovation when necessary.
- O. Given the opportunity to respond to cross-examination, respond carefully, succinctly, and appropriately, and if necessary, admit lack of knowledge.
- P. Given a debate topic, arrange ideas by topic, time and history, problem and solution, or relationship.
- Q. Given components and elements of style, exhibit and identify those related to the use of language, use of voice, speech style, and nonverbal style.

- R. Given the opportunity to serve as a debate judge, understand the criteria for judging and ethically carry out the duties and tasks required.
- S. Given the requirements of debating internationally, understand and exhibit the demands required of debaters arguing within the confines of foreign languages, countries, and customs.
- T. Given the benefits of debate clubs in schools, devise ways to foster support, inclusion, and cooperation.
- U. Given an opportunity to read or hear a debate, flow the debate using appropriate columns and references.

The TCOs are keyed to the activities in each lesson.